

## Press coverage of the consequences of famine in Kazakhstan and Ukraine: comparative analysis

**Abstract.** *One of the most tragic events in history was the artificial famine of 1929-1933 among the countries of the Soviet Union. As a result of the decision of the Communist Party to resettle Kazakhs and forced collectivization, the country suffered from hunger and mass exhaustion. People, deprived of their property, food and water, experienced terrible events. The people of Ukraine did not escape such a fate either. The two countries that gained independence at the same time reveal the secrets and truths of those dark years. In 2006, the Ukrainian parliament declared the 1929-1933 famine «genocide», calling it a deliberate assassination attempt on the people. Scientists are looking for evidence of historical justice and damage to the people and property of the country. Kazakhstani historians and researchers also continue to work on the restoration of historical justice. President Kassym-Jomart Tokayev instructed to create a special state commission to clarify the history of these years and establish historical justice. All this will help convey the true and reliable history of our sovereign country to the younger generation, pay tribute to the innocent victims of the famine, as well as justify the names of the Kazakh intelligent's who suffered from political repression. This article describes the tragic years in Kazakhstan and Ukraine, which suffered the most from famine during the Soviet era.*

**Keywords:** *famine, Holodomor, collectivization, national intelligent's, genocide.*

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.32523/2616-7174-2020-132-3-40-45>

Түсті: 21.08.20 / Қайта түзетілді: 16.09.20 / Жарияланымға рұқсат етілді: 30.09.20

**Introduction.** Some of the Kazakh people, who were subjected to man-made famine and full pressure from the authorities, were killed, and now some of them were forced to leave their livestock and move abroad. The difficulties of other kazakhs who stayed in their motherland did not finished with this. Intelligentsia and all those who close to them became “the enemies of people” and it discouraged the nation who was not prospering. The hidden secrets for seventy years had become known when the independence was announced. Otherwise if to deepen into unrevealed pages of our history it is known that suffered Kazakh intelligentsia hasn't been justified fully yet. The problem is an unavailability to get reach to the secret archive of Russia for domestic scientists. In this case The President of Kazakhstan Kassym-Zhomart Tokayev instructed to complete the reestablishing historical equity and to erect the

commission on justifying repressed people. “A great terror” brought a plenty of misery to the people who lived in USSR. In those years over five million people were deported from all over USSR. About one hundred thousand people were repressed and twenty thousand people were shot... Starved people and those who were forced to leave their homeland will be mentioned in this article. Nearly three million people were affected by the tragedy. We will open the way to a perfect future only by remembering each of the innocent victims,” he said. It gave us an opportunity to unravel the mysteries of history for domestic scientists. We believe now that we are not the country that is not starving because of illiteracy, but that we are trying to destroy the whole population by various means, by not being able to learn to settle down, by collectivization and deprivation.

**Main part.** Today, “the Holodomor” tragedy in Ukraine is recognized by 19 countries as

genocide and by several countries as a «crime against humanity.» In October 2018, a monument to the victims of the Ukrainian famine was opened in Canada. Earlier, the mayor of Austin, the capital of the US state of Texas, called the famine in Ukraine in 1932-1933 a «genocide against the Ukrainian people» and set a special day of remembrance. These events brought the Kazakh people back to the dark years and gave them a glimpse into history. The famine of 1929-1933 affected not only the Ukrainian people, but also every country in the Soviet Union. However it is known that Kazakhstan and Ukraine are the leaders in the loss of livestock. The population of Kazakhstan was decreased for 24 % from that hunger. Also Ukraine lost about 13, 3 % of its population. According to the social research of National Scientific Academy and demographical institution in 2017 this list is concluded with the countries such as Russia (3, 2%) and Belarus (1, 3%).

Historian Sarah Cameron, assistant professor of history at the University of Maryland-College Park in America: «during the famine, the Kazakh people, like Ukrainians, were subjected to violence by the Soviet government. For example, closing the borders so that hungry people do not escape across the border to another country, not bringing hungry residents closer to the city's territory, as well as creating a black list of areas affected by hunger. It is not superfluous to say that the latter was the subject of an assassination attempt on the Kazakhs. At the same time, Moscow also committed cruel, inhumane acts in Kazakhstan. In particular, the slaughter of thousands of hungry Kazakhs on the Kazakh-Chinese border, the expulsion of hungry Kazakhs from their land and pastures, all this led to the creation of Karlag, which was not in Ukraine. Well, there was no such camp in Ukraine. In fact, Kazakhs suffered more from famine than Ukrainians. As a result of the famine, Kazakhs underwent a cultural transformation, lost their nomadic way of life. And the Ukrainians survived it» [1], - says after a decade of research.

This famine was a different from other taboos. Many countries that were under the power of USSR had the famine. As the result of droughts

harvest was not grown well so people started starving and lost their livestock in 1921-1922. However hunger in 1931-1932 was the result of unsystematic planned policy of cruel authority. It all started with the idea of «collectivization», which Stalin's group wanted to rule over its nations. The plan "to destroy" an entire country and nation was implemented to the authority with the coming the secretary of the regional party committee of Kazakhstan Philip Isaevich Goloshchekin. Called bloody hand, F.I. Goloshchekin, began to organize the «Little October» event in Kazakhstan. He He may have felt the effects of collectivization, the starvation of the population, the opposition to the government of the Republic, the removal of former statesmen from positions of responsibility, and replaced them with people with little experience in the field, who strictly follow the authority. He slandered, persecuted and executed the intellectuals of the nation who opposed him. Land and property, which our ancestors preserved for centuries with the help of a spear, the power of the wrist, were not easily given by the people, and in many places Kazakh peasants protested against the actions of local authorities. In 1929, there were 143 strikes against local authorities and party leaders, in 1930 – 139, and in 1931 – 178; there was also a mass strikes of peasants. According to official documents, in the period from 1929 to 31, there were 372 peasant strikes in Kazakhstan. 80 thousand people attended to these strikes. According to the provided by the UPPA's (United political public administration) political secret department on December 1, 1931, there were 54 strikes in 1929, 77 in 1930, and 372 strikes in 1931, including all of them [2].

Riots and protests against the authorities were also frequent during the reign of Stanislav Kosior, general secretary of the Central Committee in Ukraine from 1927 to 1934. In this country, too, there was a forced collectivization of the collective farm, accusations of «kulaks», «nationalists», «counter-revolutionaries» and forced collectivization. Peasants became free labor by saying "You are got paid by your work". Peasants deprived of food and clothing began a mass strike against the authorities. Historics

mention about 4000 peasant strikes at the beginning 1930.

In 1920-1930 years USSR publications published the list of regions, collective farm, enterprise, even the names of ordinary people who could not executed the plan. Listed debtors on the "black board" were taxed and charged. At the time of hunger condition of those who included to this list was really harsh. They often had to work hard and be robbed of their last food and drink. This task was performed by local leaders who were ready «to over fulfill». The people from Kazakhstan, Ukraine, Kuban, Volga regions were hang on the «disgrace board» that did not receive the planned amount of bread. In August 1932, the «Five Harvest Laws» were enforced. According to the new law for the steel anything which belonged to the government it was forced to confiscate all property and sentenced to the prison for 10 years, in some cases it could be a death penalty. For the hidden taken "Little harvest" to make some bread foster mothers were sentenced to the prison. Officials unaware of the agriculture sent to the posts further aggravated the situation. Every single person for them seemed to be as "Counterrevolutionary element". I remind again that the government took these laws not accidentally. All was planned [3]. «Kazakh peasants have also been slandered under the Law on the Protection of Socialist Property, which is popularly known as the "Five Harvest Law." For the taking in order "to make the life end hidden harvest" they could be accused as "Looted the property of the collective farm" and sentenced to the death penalty.

According to the words of witness of Holodomor they were so exhausted, blinded, and starved to death that they had to eat the bodies of the dead. In Ukraine, 2,500 people were prosecuted for cannibalism.

In west countries, especially in Ukraine, it is focused on starve and a new information are publishing. Robert Conquest, one of the first scholars to study and write about the famine in the Soviet government, said: "The planned famine in Moscow was aimed at destroying Ukrainian peasants as a national stronghold.» Ukrainian peasants were annihilated, first of all, not

because they were peasants, but because they were Ukrainians» [4]. In 2006, the Verkhovna Rada of Ukraine declared a conspiracy to destroy its nation in 1929-1933, as genocide. Today, 19 countries of the world agree with this statement.

During his rule, I. Stalin was known for proving only the statements of his views on ideological issues, disagreeing with others, and trying to form an ideology that would ensure his own unlimited power. That's why to form political parties and to share with personal opinion were forbidden and any free opinions were suffocated. The authoritarian political system that emerged in the 1920s and 1930s restricted the right of classes, groups, and individuals to express their views freely and restricted their right to interfere in political power. Stalin put in practice his principle not only for one nation, but all nations in Soviet Union. He used every inhabitant of the countries under his control as a lifeless puppet that carried out his own scheming ideas. He aimed to make people praise only him and do what he ordered and worship him by becoming them slavery. Supporters and local leaders of Stalin surpass even him. The leadership did everything possible to double the task from above, to further provoke and narrow the country.

Isabel Ohio, a senior researcher at the French National Research Center, said: "The ideology of settlement has been combined with the replacement of traditional Kazakh economic and social practices. It is aimed to direct the development of Kazakhs from animal husbandry into planting or transition to sedentary livestock and elimination of tribal structures. The most severe blow for Kazakhs engaged in animal husbandry was the mass meat preparation campaign, which culminated in 1931.as the result of hunger the quantity of population decreased up to two billion three hundred or one third population of the republic and the number of cattle decreased from forty-five million to eight million. Thus, resettlement was followed by the resettlement of refugees who were unable to return to the livestock economy due to a catastrophic shortage of livestock and became entirely dependent on state assistance. Over one million Kazakhs had to resettle to neighboring

countries. The truth is hard to compare Kazakh hunger with any other. Ukraine lost 7 million people and it is only 15% of its population. But here 80% of Kazakhs died. It is not claimed as a Kazakh-directed genocide, but consequences exceeded even genocide" [5].

Starve of 1929-1930 was a common tragedy for all Soviet Union countries. During these years, the terrible famine caused by severe drought affected not only Kazakhstan and Ukraine, but also the Volga region, the Urals and Asia. This massacre was seen from every side to every nation. From one side was starve, from another side was constant oppression of the authorities was the reason of dying innocent people and in order to survive and to save offspring they had to leave their homeland. In an attempt to solve the threat to their country without a war, they accused the Kazakh intelligentsia and rebels of trying to distance themselves from the harsh policies of the authorities, and sentenced them to death, calling them «enemies of the people.» The darkness has not yet subsided; it has affected the demographic growth of the Kazakh people, the slowdown in economic development. Many of the traditions that our ancestors have preserved for centuries have not been passed on to the

present generation, and some have even been destroyed. Our culture has also stagnated. «This famine has devastated the Kazakhs so much that after this darkness, the Kazakhs even became a different nation. They are a minority in their own land. The root cause of the development of modern Kazakh culture and language dates back to that time. Famine killed the Kazakh culture" [6].

**Conclusion.** The historical reality of the tragic years has not yet been fully revealed. The truth is still unanswered, and many questions remain unanswered. In this regard, President Kassym-Zhomart Tokayev received Krymbek Kusherbayev on September 22 this year, outlined important issues for the country and gave a number of instructions. Especially, he instructed the special state commission to fully rehabilitate the victims of political repressions to take action on the suffering of the Kazakh people. Extensive study of the history of famine and its frequent publication will undoubtedly help to increase the value of the country and the land for today's generation. All this allows us to study modern life, explaining how difficult and contradictory our ancestors went through.

#### References

1. Батеева З. Ашаршылық глазами Сары Кэмерон. –Астана: Экспресс К, 2018. 18 декабря. –С. 5.
2. Акгедік Е. 1929-1931ж.ж. Қызыл империяға қарсы 372 көтеріліс болғанын білеміз бе? –Астана: Қазақстан-Заман. 2013 ж. 9 шілде. –3 б.
3. Кокунько Г. Рассказчивание. Черные доски. Часть 2. Белое дело в Гражданской войне в России. 1917-1922 гг. –Москва: Посев, 2005. – С. 37.
4. Конквест Р. Жатва скорби: Советская коллективизация и террор голодом. Перевод с английского И. Коэн и Н. Май. – Хайфа: 2005. – С. 296.
5. Мыңжасарқызы Д. Қазақстандағы ашаршылық: сұрапыл зұлматқа берілген саяси баға. –Алматы: Түркістан, 2012. 7 маусым. –2 б.
6. Верхотуров Д. Ашаршылық: история Великого голода. –Москва: Литагент. 2010, - С. 14.

#### References

1. Bateeva Z. Asharshylyk glazami Sary Kameron [Hunger through the eyes of Sarah Cameron]. (Astana, Ekspress K, 2018, 18 december, 5 p.). [in Kazakh]
2. Akgedik E. 1929-1931 jj. «Kyzyl imperyaga karsy 372 koterilis bolganyn bilemiz be?» [1929-1931 «Do we know that there were 372 revolts against the Red Empire?】 (Astana, Kazakhstan-Zaman, 2013. 9 july, 3 p.). [in Kazakh]
3. Kokunko G. Raskazachivanie. Chernye doski. Chast' 2. Beloe delo v Grazhdanskoi voine v Rossii. 1917-1922 gg [Decorating. Black boards. Part 2. White case in the Civil War in Russia. 1917-1922 y.] (Moscow, Posev, 2005, 37 p.). [in Russian]

4. Konkvest P. Zhatva skorbi: Sovetskaya kollektivizaciya i terror golodom. [Harvest of sorrow: Soviet collectivization and terror by famine] Perevod s anglijskogo [Translated from English] I. Koen i N. Mai. (Haifa, 2005, 296 p.). [in Russian]

5. Mynzhasarkyzy D. Kazakstandagy asharsylyk: surapyl zulmatka berilgen sayasi baga. [Famine in Kazakhstan: a political assessment of the terrible darkness]. (Almaty, Turkestan, 2012, 7 june, 2 p.). [in Kazakh]

6. Verhoturov D. Asharsylyk: istoriya Velikogo goloda [ Hunger: The Story of the Great Famine]. (Moskow, Litagent, 2010, 14 p.). [in Russian]

**Р.А. Шакуова**

*Л.Н. Гумилев атындағы Еуразия ұлттық университеті, Нұр-Сұлтан, Қазақстан*

### **Қазақстан мен Украинадағы ашаршылық зардаптарының мерзімді баспасөздегі көрінісі: салыстырмалы талдау**

**Аңдатпа.** Тарихтағы қасіретке толы ұмтылмас оқиғалардың бірі – Кеңес Одағының құрамына кіретін елдер арасында 1929-1933 жылдары болған қолдан жасалған ашаршылық. Коммунистік партияның қазақ халқын отырықшы өмірге көшіру және күштеп ұжымдастыру туралы шешімінің нәтижесінде ел ашаршылыққа ұшырап, халық жаппай қырыла бастады. Мал-мүлкінен айырылып, ішер ас-сусыз қалған халық небір жан түршігерлік оқиғаларды бастан кешірді. Дәл осындай нәубет күндер Украина халқын да айналып өтпеді. Тәуелсіздігін қатар алған қос мемлекет сол бір зұлмат жылдардың құпияларын ақтарып, өз ақиқаттарын жариялауда. 2006 жылы Украин Радасы 1929-1933 жылдары болған ашаршылықты халқына қасақана жасалған қастандық екенін айтып, «геноцид» деп жариялады. Ғалымдар ел халқы мен мүлкіне келген шығын мен тарихи шындықты дәлелдеу үшін жан-жақты ізденіп жатыр. Қазақстан тарапы да тәуелсіздік алған тұстан бастап, нәубет жылдардың тигізген қасіретін анықтауда. Мемлекет басшысы Қасым-Жомарт Тоқаев осы бір жылдардың ақ-қарасын анықтап, тарихи әділдікті орнату үшін арнайы мемлекеттік комиссия құруды тапсырды. Мұндай шараның барлығы егеменді еліміздің тарихы өскелең ұрпаққа бұрмаланбай жетуіне, ақтаңдақ жылдары қасірет көрген жандардың рухына тағызым ету мақсатында, сонымен қатар, жазықсыз саяси қуғын-сүргін құрбаны болған ұлт зиялыларының ақталуына септігін тигізбек. Бұл мақалада Кеңес Одағы тұсында ашаршылықтан ең көп зардап шеккен Қазақстан мен Украина елдеріндегі нәубет жылдардың қасіреті жайында айтылады.

**Түйін сөздер:** ашаршылық, Голодомор, ұжымдастыру, ұлт зиялылары, геноцид.

**Р.А. Шакуова**

*Евразийский национальный университет имени Л.Н. Гумилева, Нур-Султан, Казахстан*

### **Освещение в печатных изданиях последствий голода в Казахстане и Украине: сравнительный анализ**

**Аннотация.** Одним из самых трагических событий в истории стал искусственный голод 1929-1933 годов в странах Советского Союза. В результате решения Коммунистической партии о переселении казахов и насильственной коллективизации страна пострадала от голода и массового истощения. Люди, лишенные своего имущества, пищи и воды, пережили ужасные события. Не избежал такой участи и народ Украины. Две страны, одновременно получившие независимость, раскрывают секреты и правду тех мрачных лет. В 2006 году украинский парламент объявил голод 1929-1933 годов «геноцидом», назвав его преднамеренным покушением на народ. Ученые ищут доказательства исторической справедливости и ущерба, нанесенного народу и имуществу страны. Казахские историки и исследователи тоже продолжают работать над восстановлением исторической справедливости. Президент Касым-Жомарт Тоқаев поручил создать специальную государственную комиссию для выяснения истории этих лет и установления исторической справедливости. Все это поможет передать правдивую и достоверную историю нашей суверенной страны подрастающему поколению, отдать дань уважения невинным жертвам

голода, а также оправдать представителей казахской интеллигенции, пострадавшей от политических репрессий. В данной статье рассказывается о трагических годах в Казахстане и Украине, которые больше всего пострадали от голода в советское время.

**Ключевые слова:** голод, Голодомор, коллективизация, интеллигенция народа, геноцид.

**Information about author:**

*Shakuova Rima* – Senior lecturer of the faculty of Journalism and political science, L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University, Nur-Sultan, Kazakhstan.

*Шакуова Рима* – Журналистика және саясаттану факультетінің аға оқытушысы, Л.Н. Гумилев атындағы Еуразия ұлттық университеті, Нұр-Сұлтан, Қазақстан.